

# Comparative Law in a Global Context

THE LEGAL SYSTEMS OF  
ASIA AND AFRICA

SECOND EDITION

WERNER MENSKI

CAMBRIDGE

# CONTENTS

<i>Preface and acknowledgments</i>	page xi
<i>Table of cases</i>	xv
<i>Table of statutes</i>	xvii
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	xx

## PART I Comparative framework

Introduction: Globalisation and Asian and African legal systems 3

- 1 Comparative law and legal theory from a global perspective 25
  - 1.1 The culture-specific nature of law and respect for difference 26
  - 1.2 Changing global scenario: from colonial transplant to ethnic implant 37
    - 1.2.1 International law and its unifying pressures 38
    - 1.2.2 Comparative law as a harmonising handmaiden 46
    - 1.2.3 Assumptions about uniformity: legal transplants and reception of laws 50
    - 1.2.4 Southern voices: from polite silence to post-colonial reassertion 55
  - 1.3 New globalisation: reverse colonisation and ethnic implants 58
  - 1.4 Good practice in studying and teaching comparative law 66
  - 1.5 World legal history: a deficient model 70
  - 1.6 A model of pluralist, globality-conscious legal education 75
- 2 Legal pluralism 82
  - 2.1 Early conceptualisations of legal pluralism 85
  - 2.2 The historical school of law 88
  - 2.3 Early legal pluralism: Ehrlich's 'living law' 92
  - 2.4 Reluctant pluralism: Hart's primary and secondary rules 98
  - 2.5 Postmodern theories of legal pluralism 103
    - 2.5.1 Moore's concept of the 'semi-autonomous' social field 104
    - 2.5.2 Allott's three perspectives on law 108

2.5.3	Griffiths' theory of legal pluralism	113
2.5.4	Chiba's tripartite model of law	119
3	Comparative jurisprudence: images and reflections of law	129
3.1	Traditional natural law theories in outline	131
3.2	Greek legal philosophy	134
3.3	Roman legal philosophy	139
3.4	Early and later medieval developments in Church law	141
3.5	Re-evaluation of natural law during Renaissance and Reformation	146
3.6	Legal positivism	150
3.7	Beyond positivism	160
3.7.1	Socio-legal approaches	161
3.7.2	New natural law theories	168
3.8	A global working definition of law	173

## PART II Regional comparisons in a global context

	Introduction	193
4	Hindu law: the search for appropriateness	196
4.1	A historical and conceptual overview	200
4.2	The pre-classical stage: Vedic law (c. 1500 BC to c. 500 BC)	204
4.3	Classical Hindu law (c. 500 BC to c. 200 AD)	209
4.4	Late classical Hindu law (c. 500 BC to c. 1100 AD)	222
4.5	Post-classical Hindu law (after 1100)	234
4.6	Medieval Hindu law under Muslim domination	237
4.7	Anglo-Hindu law	239
4.8	Modern Hindu family law in India	249
4.9	Hindu legal concepts and the Indian Constitution	259
4.10	Searching for composite appropriateness in postmodernity	273
5	Islamic law: God's law or men's law?	279
5.1	Understanding Islamic law from a legal pluralist perspective	281
5.2	The Qur'anic base and its application	289
5.3	The Prophet's roles: leader, judge and guide	294
5.4	Early Islamic law after the Prophet's death	298
5.5	Legal developments in the early Muslim empire: the Umayyads	303
5.6	Scholar-jurists and the Abbasids	309
5.7	The central role of jurists	312
5.7.1	Schools of law and competing doctrines	312
5.7.2	Shafi'i scheme to unify Muslim jurisprudence	315
5.7.3	Hadith collections and the 'Schacht controversy'	319
5.8	Continuing diversities after Shafi'i	324
5.9	Judicial administration: <i>qadis</i> and <i>muftis</i>	330
5.10	Subsidiary sources of law	333

5.11	The purported closing of the 'gates of <i>ijtihad</i> '	339
5.12	The shift towards legal reforms	344
5.13	Turkey as a secular Muslim country	354
5.14	Pakistani law and Islamisation	364
6	African laws: the search for law	380
6.1	The denial of African culture and laws	385
6.2	The search for African law and legal theory	390
6.3	The nature of traditional African laws	404
6.3.1	Reflections of early knowledge	404
6.3.2	African worldviews and their conceptual implications	407
6.3.3	African religions and socio-ritual processes	413
6.3.4	African customary law as a self-controlling system	421
6.3.5	Dispute settlement processes in pre-colonial Africa	435
6.4	African laws under colonial rule	444
6.4.1	The process of colonisation	445
6.4.2	The colonial impact on African customary systems	453
6.4.3	The colonial impact on dispute settlement processes	459
6.5	African laws in the post-colonial period	464
6.5.1	The continuing devaluation of African traditions	466
6.5.2	Debates about custom in modern African laws	470
6.5.3	Dispute settlement and the problems of finding justice	477
6.5.4	The unification debate as a tool for nation-building	480
6.6	The future	485
7	Chinese law: code and conduct	493
7.1	Scholarly representations of Chinese laws	495
7.2	Traditional Chinese worldviews in their social and legal context	502
7.2.1	The cosmic dimension: <i>tao</i>	503
7.2.2	Self-controlled order, Chinese style: <i>li</i>	505
7.2.3	The social context of traditional Chinese legal regulation	512
7.2.4	The place of customary laws	518
7.3	The classical Chinese legal system: codes and what else?	521
7.3.1	Historical overview of codification in China	521
7.3.2	The conceptual emphasis on penal law	523
7.3.3	The key concept of <i>fa</i> and the influence of legalism	525
7.3.4	Confucianisation of the law	531
7.4	The practical application of the law	534
7.4.1	The imperial code system as a formal framework	535
7.4.2	The Emperor as Son of Heaven	538
7.4.3	The imperial legal machinery	541
7.4.4	Avoidance of the law	547
7.4.5	Social and ritual differentiation in the law	555

7.5	Post-imperial Chinese legal systems	560
7.5.1	Resistance to modernising reforms	561
7.5.2	Introduction of Western laws in the Republican period	564
7.5.3	The communist foundations of Chinese law	566
7.6	Law in the People's Republic of China	569
7.6.1	The ambivalent approach to law in Mao's China	570
7.6.2	The post-Maoist reconstruction of Chinese law	579
7.6.3	The new legal structures and the future	584
	Conclusion: towards global legal realism	594
	<i>References</i>	614
	<i>Index</i>	659